

**MINUTES  
GRADUATE COUNCIL**

March 19<sup>th</sup>, 2015  
1:00 P.M.

**264 GRINTER HALL CONFERENCE ROOM**

- MEMBERS PRESENT:** Dr. R. Paul Duncan (Acting Chair), Dr. Nancy Fichtman Dana, Dr. Amir Erez, Dr. Ann Horgas, Dr. Christopher Janelle, Dr. Ellen Martin, Dr. Heather McAuslane, Dr. Joanna Peris, Dr. Cindy Prins
- MEMBERS ABSENT:** Dr. Henry Frierson, (Chair), Dr. Kevin Orr, Dr. Connie Shehan, Dr. Dietmar Siemann, Dr. Pamela Soltis, Ms. Courtney Reijo (GSC), Mr. Nathan Blinn (GSC alternate)
- GUESTS PRESENT:** Dr. Sharon Abramowitz (Anthropology & CAS), Dr. Wesley Bolch (College of Engineering), Mr. Rick Bryant (Admissions), Mr. Rajeeb Das (Office of Institutional Assessment), Dr. Juan Gilbert (CISE), Ms. Mary Ann Hagler (Office of the Registrar), Mr. Brian K. Marchman (Distance & Continuing Education), Mr. Mark Zakshevsky (Distance & Continuing Education)
- STAFF PRESENT:** Ms. Gann Enholm, Dr. Emelia Hodge, Mr. Matthew Mitterko, Dr. Rhonda Moraca, Ms. Caitlin Nelson (recording), Mr. Robert Parker, Ms. Stacy Wallace.

Meeting was called to order at 1:01 p.m.

**I. ACTION ITEMS**

1. **Minutes from the February 19, 2015 Graduate Council meeting** (Enclosure 1). No discussion. Motion to approve was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

**GRADUATE CERTIFICATE:**

2. **Proposal from the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences for a new graduate certificate in Medical Anthropology (#9526)** (Enclosure 2). Tabled from the February Graduate Council meeting. Dr. Sharon Abramowitz was present for discussion.

Dr. Abramowitz gave an introductory presentation, describing the proposed certificate and its perceived merits, arguing that if UF were to adopt this graduate certificate it would place UF among a very limited number of premier institutions who have certificates in Medical Anthropology and are seen as being at the center of global health. The certificate is seen as complementary to core training in anthropology – that is, the primary methodological training is in core disciplines, the certificate courses would provide tools for advanced graduate practice, to be able to put culture and health into conversation with each other. Successful implementation is based in part on strong advising support for any student in the program.

Dr. Duncan introduced discussion: Staff have reviewed this and have worked with Dr. Abramowitz extensively and there continues to be a concern about the breadth of the certificate and whether multiple students getting this certificate will in fact each have a single certificate (and single transcript notation) reflecting multiple different trainings. It is additionally atypical that it is the intention of the department to limit eligibility to UF graduate students. Many certificates at UF have a target audience

for external or non-degree-seeking students, and that is not the case here, and there are no current plans to move in that direction.

Lengthy discussion among the members ensued:

Q: Are there any required courses? A capstone course?

Abramowitz: There is a core of courses that students will be able to choose from: 6 credits from a sub-list of selected courses which have been vetted by the department, for a core set of literatures and methodologies. The last 3 credits students will be able to pursue as a rotating topics course as an elective which focuses on health issues.

Q: On the sub-list of 6 credits, how many courses are on that list?

A: 9 – choose two out of 9.

Q: Is that a smaller number than last month?

Duncan: No, that's a smaller number than originally.

Q: You feel confident that even though one student might take one thing and one another, that they would have an equivalent knowledge of the core foundation principles.

A: I do – I'll share a brief story: I'm working with 250 anthropologists to develop a response to the global Ebola epidemic, and in that process I've been working with people from all across the spectrum (forensics, funerary practices, microbiology). We have all come together around a common set of approaches around the engagement between health and culture and it hasn't been a problem at all – there are a diverse array of skills at the table.

Q: That was a concern last time, and I appreciate your description, to which you have clearly given a lot of thought. If you were to take a particularly focused set of courses, it would seem that that may exclude some other topics that would be in the SLOs. I hear you saying that there's a holistic treatment of the SLOs, but from the outside it seems like a narrower focus may have ramifications.

A: Anthropology is paying a lot of attention to the governance of this certificate – the requirements are more than just student course requirements – it's the admission, advising, and successful completion of the program. There's a conversation across all members of the faculty to establish what people need to know to know anthropology.

Q: There was some resistance to the possibility of multiple certificates that would be more focused. Has your group entertained that possibility?

A: I took it back to my whole faculty, and we decided that we think that the promise of Medical Anthropology (which is the largest growing subfield of anthropology in the world) is the fact that people are borrowing from very different places to generate unique outcomes. We are encountering people doing very differing things: situations in which someone is focused on forensic anthropology, but has taken a course on human rights and health, and is being dispatched to Bosnia to work on mass graves – so it's the opportunity for mixing that makes this a robust space to pursue research. Especially medical students, nursing, etc. It's going to allow them to entertain a lot of facets of their curiosity with a good network as they move forward in their careers. We are also focused on internationalization, which we have here.

Q: Within that broad scope, that would imply that any student getting the certificate could be considered a medical anthropologist?

A: The degree of difficulty of this certificate would help elevate the bar for training for our own grad students. This would increase the standard for consideration and for research.

Q: So, it's more about the advising than the courses?

A: The courses would be very connected to an advising relationship.

Duncan: So you know, medical students would not be eligible for admission to this certificate as you have written it, as they are professional students, not graduate students.

A: We will have to adjust that some time.

Duncan: All the students will have that same transcript remark – it's a fair question for UF to ask if that same transcript remark is going to be accurate given the diversity of content. Is it fair to prospective observers to have them figure out all the variation embedded in that remark?

A: I do think it's fair that any configuration of these courses would be classified as medical anthropology, and that that would be understandable to an HR staff person. The single line on the certificate speaks to the fact that any given student would have spent 45 weeks in a class thinking

about the relationship between culture and health, and working intensively on that connection. That's a long time and I have pretty high standards for my own students, and I feel that this is a sufficient bar to categorize themselves as medical anthropologists.

Q: I hate to beat a dead horse – it seems to me that most of these courses have “culture” in the title, but Human Osteology and Molecular Genetics not so much – would they get that aspect in those courses?

A: Human osteometry is fundamental in biological anthropology; genetics is an epigenetics class: that is, how the environment impacts our genes – so how structural factors like poverty, nutrition, etc. alter us at the genetic level.

Q: Ethnographic Field Methods is what?

A: That's a research methods course which deals very intensively with research ethics with human populations. That's very important at a graduate level – you are almost always working with humans and this methods course talks about how to deal with these issues in a more legal, ethical, legitimate way.

Q: So there's not a direct relationship to health, but there could be an assignment in that course which would apply?

A: Yes.

Q: We talked about the flexibility in the foundation courses – there is a lot of flexibility in the elective courses! Can you talk about that?

A: These are actually not rotating topics courses – it reflects that we haven't put through paperwork for permanent course numbers. We also want to make sure that students have the opportunity to do directed research.

Q: What would resolve many of these issues is an independent study – there they can apply everything they have learned in the other courses and put it all together in a research project, for example. That also solidifies the advising relationship, to connect the content of courses to a research project – that helps elevate the notion that it's about the advising.

A: We discussed that issue, and our concern is that three core topical courses are necessary for students to have an immersive experience. That fourth course may be prohibitive in terms of the amount of time demands they have – they have demands on their time and they are often only funded to a certain extent.

Q: But there have been other certificates that require that people do an independent study for their dissertation, or that they have to have some written product that reflected the core content. Your argument against the final project I don't think really holds – even busy grad students can take courses that supplement their knowledge, but don't have to complete the certificate. In order to complete the certificate some kind of capstone product or project that would pull the content together, I don't think that's unreasonable.

A: That how we thought about the completion interview, and the SLOs – that's an opportunity to assess whether or not they have successfully completed the certificate. The standard is three courses in US and Canada, so the fourth course might achieve the objective you're talking about, but would be atypical.

Duncan: It would be atypical in that context, but in the UF context it would be more typical.

A: But if we are looking at certificates offered in universities in the western hemisphere, this is comparable. I completed one of these at Harvard, and if anything it was looser. So the 9-credit limit is something we see as being achievable and attractive. Our concern about independent study is that not all students will be well served by that study – we have a lot of good courses already that will help students round out their training.

Duncan: Can you ever imagine at the exit interview that any student would be denied?

A: Probably not.

Duncan: But if that's an important part of your SLOs, then it has to be measurable. A measuring device that has zero differentiation isn't a measuring device at all.

A: It is very much on the mind of the people teaching to make sure they're prepared for the medical anthropology SLOs – that's a benefit in that it imposes a set of standards throughout the curriculum.

There was further discussion on the admissions being limited to only UF graduate students. It was noted that the submitting department would have to manage admissions to the certificate program, as the admissions system does not differentiate graduate status from professional, for example.

Motion to approve, conditional on the clarification of the eligible student population, was made, seconded, and unanimously approved, effective Fall 2015 pending other approvals.

#### **2015-2018 BALLOT:**

- 3. Selection of candidates to include on the ballot for election to Graduate Council 2015-2018** (Enclosure 3). Dr. Duncan thanked the nominating committee for their service. Motion to accept the ballot was made and seconded. No discussion. Unanimously approved.

## **II. INFORMATION ITEMS**

- 4. Proposal from the Warrington College of Business Administration for the termination of the concentration in Supply Chain Management (#10061)**, administratively approved for Summer 2015 (Enclosure 4).
- 5. Proposal from the College of Pharmacy to change the graduate certificate name from Forensic Serology and DNA to Forensic DNA and Serology (#10043)**, administratively approved for Summer 2015 (Enclosure 5).
- 6. Proposal from the College of Engineering for the termination of the graduate certificate in Systems Engineering (#9939)**, administratively approved for Spring 2017 (Enclosure 6).
- 7. Proposal from the College of Engineering for the termination of the graduate certificate in Advanced Systems Engineering (#10001)**, administratively approved for Spring 2017 (Enclosure 7).
- 8. Graduate Programs – Distance and Self-Funded:**
  - Graduate Certificate in Health Outcomes and Policy
  - Graduate Certificate in Wildlife Forensic Sciences
  - Graduate Certificate in Sustainable Agroecosystems

## **III. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

- 9. Graduate certificate policy section titled “Criteria for completion of a graduate certificate,” item #3 “Credits earned at another institution may not be used to meet the requirements of a University of Florida graduate certificate”** (Enclosure 9).

Dr. Duncan presented the discussion item: The Graduate School received a proposal for a certificate that included a course not offered at UF, which is explicitly against the current graduate certificate policy. That section of the policy was intended as administrative device to reduce the complexities of evaluating and transferring credit. The issue at hand today is whether the Council wishes to revisit this issue of accepting external credits, and if so, with what kinds of boundaries. A change in policy will take time and deserves careful thought as to the constraints.

Discussion ensued: It was noted that a dual-degree participant would not, under current policy, be allowed to complete a certificate based on a combination of courses. It was also noted that there are staffing issues associated with the evaluation of transfer credits, and that both the Office of Admissions and Graduate School would feel the need for more staff resources to accommodate

additional work of this kind. Individual petitions would not necessarily solve the issue at hand. In the case of this particular certificate, the international experience is essential to the content of the certificate, not merely a case of interchanging courses. A member indicated that a 6905 “International Experience” course could be crafted to allow UF credits for an international experience; however, this would potentially burden the student with paying tuition at both institutions. In conclusion, Graduate Council members did not see a need to revise current the graduate certificate policy.

**10. New degree proposal for a Ph.D. in Human-Centered Computing (#9694)** (Enclosure 10). Dr. Juan Gilbert and Dr. Wesley Bolch were present for discussion.

Dr. Duncan introduced the discussion item: A new degree proposal for a Ph.D. in Human-Centered Computing (HCC) is expected at Graduate Council soon. We wanted to introduce it now as a discussion item due to the complexities involved to give members a chance to preview the content.

Dr. Juan Gilbert introduced the degree proposal: HCC is emerging discipline. I received my Ph.D. in 2000 but I had to study HCC or human-computer interaction separately. I had to get a Ph.D. and two master’s degrees to cover the area. Georgia Tech was the first institution to say we need a separate degree, and then conversations started around what should this degree would look like. We started as a consortium to create the degree, and designed it with the idea that students should be able to look at real world problems and design computational solutions, implement them from software perspective, and evaluate and assess them. These are the three separate aspects to this degree, and all of these are needed in industry.

Discussion ensued:

Q: You included a few job ads, and looking through those ads, they didn’t require a Ph.D. – can you address the need for a Ph.D.?

JG: The ads don’t say that because the number of degree-holding candidates is currently low; they don’t want to cut their pool. However, placement rate for graduating students from these degrees is very high – employers won’t post for Ph.D. but they will hire up.

Duncan: Dr. Gilbert has been working closely with the College of Engineering, and Dr. Bolch is here to say that this is a fairly well put-together process. Note: this is a Ph.D. program, not doctor of something else. Yet, it’s not quite as simple as an existing Ph.D. program with new major.

Bolch: The Provost wanted us to justify that this couldn’t just be a new track in something that already exists.

JG: There are specific needs that can only be met with a new degree, rather than cobbled together from multiple other degrees.

Duncan: Members, at the April or May meeting you will see this proposal again. When it’s in this new space, it’s difficult and complex – courses from all over coming into this new program.

Q: I have lost track of what’s happening with Computer Science at UF. Does this impact other programs?

JG: Computer Science is historically in Arts and Sciences and moved into Engineering and there are some places that are kind of torn. It’s confusing as to where it actually sits. HCC muddies more waters – because it goes across all units at the university in computing.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:07 p.m.